Headboat Discards for Red snapper in the Gulf of Mexico

by Vivian M. Matter and John F. Walter

SEDAR31-AW01

28 January 2013



This information is distributed solely for the purpose of peer review. It does not represent and should not be construed to represent any agency determination or policy.

Please cite as:

Matter, V. and J.F. Walter. 2013. Headboat Discards for Red snapper in the Gulf of Mexico. SEDAR31-AW01. SEDAR, North Charleston, SC. 10 pp.

Headboat Discards for Red snapper in the Gulf of Mexico

by Vivian M. Matter¹ and John F. Walter²

NOAA Fisheries Southeast Fisheries Science Center ¹Fisheries Statistics Division ²Sustainable Fisheries Division 75 Virginia Beach Drive Miami FL 33149

January 23, 2013 Sustainable Fisheries Division Contribution No. SFD-2013-005

Introduction

The Southeast Region Headboat Survey (SRHS) covers the Gulf of Mexico headboats starting in 1986 and collects vessel-reported landings and discard estimates in number and weight (Matter SEDAR31-DW4). Section 4.4.2 of the SEDAR 31 Data Workshop Report laid out the recommendations for generating discards for the headboat fishery using a combination of SRHS information, headboat observer estimates and a MRFSS/MRIP proxy fishery for the historical time series. The detailed methodology and the resulting discards rates and discards are presented here.

Issues:

1. SRHS self-reporting of discards appears to underestimate total discards and to <u>substantially</u> underestimate discards between 2004 and 2007 when compared to the few years of headboat observer estimated discards.

2. SRHS only has discards information beginning in 2004.

Need: To obtain a relatively consistent time series of headboat discards that tracks both the <u>trend</u> and <u>magnitude</u> for years 1981-2011.

Solution: To obtain the trend in discards it was necessary to determine a set of headboats that consistently reported the magnitude of their discards. The discard rate of these 'consistent' vessels was used to obtain the trend in discards for 2004-2011. Then the ratio of headboat observer to 'representative' SRHS was used to scale up the SRHS estimates. Finally the best-predicting MRIP proxy data series was used to predict headboat discard rates for 1981-2003.

Methods and Results

1) Use discard rates from SRHS headboats with consistent patterns of reporting for 2004-2011

To select these headboat vessels the following criteria were employed:

a) The vessel must have reported catch and discards for at least two of the four years in the year groups 2004-2007 and 2008-2011.

b) If the average 2004-2007 total discards (alive, dead for all species)/sum catch ratio is greater than 2008-2011 total discard/sum catch ratio then keep these vessels as it is likely not affected by the under-reporting in early years.

c) To obtain representative remaining vessels, we test for a significant increase in the discard rate between 2004 and 2007 and 2008-2011 that would likely be a function of a change in reporting rather than an actual change in discards. This is particularly true as the size composition of the population has increased and other sources of information indicate that discards have generally decreased during this time period. We calculate the ratio of the total discards /total catch for each year and then use a 1-tailed t-test, assuming homogenous variances to test for a significant increase in discard rates. We retain vessels that showed no significant increase in discard rates between the two stanzas.

d) Remaining 'representative' vessels are then used to calculate the headboat discard rates by East and West Gulf of Mexico.

2) Scale the resulting rates using observer data

Observer data from West Florida, Alabama, and Texas were used to scale the headboat discard rates obtained in step 1, above. These discard rates were multiplied by the ratio of the means between the Observer Program discard rates and the 'representative' headboat discard rates to obtain the scaled headboat discard rates for 2004 to 2011. The observer data could not be disaggregated into open and closed season due to the small sample size of at-sea trips. Figure 1 shows the SRHS discard rates for all vessels and consistently reporting vessels.

3) Use MRIP data as a proxy for hind-casting headboat discard rates for 1981-2003

The MRIP discard rates for all modes combined, charterboat mode, and private mode were calculated for 2004-2011. Separate linear regressions between the scaled discard rates obtained in step 2 and each MRIP mode were obtained to determine the best predictor of headboat discards. The proxy (all modes, charterboat mode, or private mode) whose discard rates had the strongest positive correlation to the 2004-2011 headboat discard rates was selected. In the East Gulf of Mexico, MRIP discard rates from all modes had the strongest positive correlation to the scaled headboat discard rates. In the West Gulf of Mexico, MRIP discard rates. The charterboat mode had the strongest positive correlation to the scaled headboat discard rates. The resulting linear regression models were then used to predict headboat discard rates from the MRIP proxy. Predictive equations are shown below:

East Gulf (where x=MRIP all modes discard ratio):

y=1.4613x $R^2=0.872$ P=0.0002 West Gulf (where x=MRIP charterboat mode discard ratio): y=0.4164x $R^{2}=0.866$ P=0.0008

Discard rates for 1981-2011 are shown in Table 1 and Figure 2.

4) Apply discard rates to headboat landings to obtain total headboat discards

To obtain the total discards the annual discard ratios obtained in step 3, above were multiplied by the headboat landings. Headboat discard estimates are shown in Table 2 and Figure 3.

References

Matter, V. 2012. SEDAR31-DW4 Recreational Survey Data for Red snapper in the Gulf of Mexico. National Marine Fisheries Service, Southeast Fisheries Science Center, Fisheries Statistics Division, Miami, FL.

Southeast Data, Assessment, and Review (SEDAR). 2012. SEDAR 31, Section II: Data Workshop Report, Gulf of Mexico Red Snapper.

Tables

| Table 1. Discard rates used estimate headboat discards by year and Gulf region. |
|---|
|---|

| 1981 0.0000 1982 0.0070 1983 0.0034 1984 0.0000 1985 0.0000 1986 0.1036 0.0191 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 2011 4.8232 0.6572 | year | East | West |
|---|------|--------|--------|
| 1983 0.0034 1984 0.0000 1985 0.0000 1986 0.1036 0.0191 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1981 | | 0.0000 |
| 1984 0.0000 1985 0.0000 1986 0.1036 0.0191 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0066 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1982 | | 0.0070 |
| 1985 0.0000 1986 0.1036 0.0191 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1983 | | 0.0034 |
| 1986 0.1036 0.0191 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1984 | | 0.0000 |
| 1987 0.1702 0.0035 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1985 | | 0.0000 |
| 1988 0.1837 0.0036 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1986 | 0.1036 | 0.0191 |
| 1989 0.5322 0.0937 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1987 | 0.1702 | 0.0035 |
| 1990 2.0340 0.8920 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1988 | 0.1837 | 0.0036 |
| 1991 2.1098 0.4857 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1989 | 0.5322 | 0.0937 |
| 1992 1.4902 0.3319 1993 1.0654 0.3268 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1990 | 2.0340 | 0.8920 |
| $\begin{array}{rrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrr$ | 1991 | 2.1098 | 0.4857 |
| 1994 1.3412 0.7052 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1992 | 1.4902 | 0.3319 |
| 1995 0.9315 0.4889 1996 2.2504 0.4553 1997 2.7289 0.2448 1998 1.8080 0.2091 1999 2.5680 0.1290 2000 3.0006 0.1656 2001 3.3929 0.2742 2002 3.0063 0.2667 2003 2.9807 0.4741 2004 1.3452 0.7165 2005 1.1356 0.7456 2006 6.1126 0.9256 2007 5.4227 1.0261 2008 6.4109 1.4979 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 1993 | 1.0654 | 0.3268 |
| 19962.25040.455319972.72890.244819981.80800.209119992.56800.129020003.00060.165620013.39290.274220023.00630.266720032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 1994 | 1.3412 | 0.7052 |
| $\begin{array}{rrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrr$ | 1995 | 0.9315 | 0.4889 |
| 19981.80800.209119992.56800.129020003.00060.165620013.39290.274220023.00630.266720032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 1996 | 2.2504 | 0.4553 |
| 19992.56800.129020003.00060.165620013.39290.274220023.00630.266720032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 1997 | 2.7289 | 0.2448 |
| 20003.00060.165620013.39290.274220023.00630.266720032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 1998 | 1.8080 | 0.2091 |
| $\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$ | 1999 | 2.5680 | 0.1290 |
| 20023.00630.266720032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2000 | 3.0006 | 0.1656 |
| 20032.98070.474120041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2001 | 3.3929 | 0.2742 |
| 20041.34520.716520051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2002 | 3.0063 | 0.2667 |
| 20051.13560.745620066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2003 | 2.9807 | 0.4741 |
| 20066.11260.925620075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2004 | 1.3452 | 0.7165 |
| 20075.42271.026120086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2005 | 1.1356 | 0.7456 |
| 20086.41091.497920094.38770.477020104.34570.6110 | 2006 | 6.1126 | 0.9256 |
| 2009 4.3877 0.4770 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 2007 | 5.4227 | 1.0261 |
| 2010 4.3457 0.6110 | 2008 | 6.4109 | 1.4979 |
| | 2009 | 4.3877 | 0.4770 |
| 2011 4.8232 0.6572 | 2010 | 4.3457 | 0.6110 |
| | 2011 | 4.8232 | 0.6572 |

| year | East | West | Total |
|------|---------|---------|---------|
| 1981 | | 0 | 0 |
| 1982 | | 2,356 | 2,356 |
| 1983 | | 1,124 | 1,124 |
| 1984 | | 0 | 0 |
| 1985 | | 0 | 0 |
| 1986 | 1,696 | 6,049 | 7,744 |
| 1987 | 1,648 | 1,114 | 2,763 |
| 1988 | 2,541 | 1,505 | 4,046 |
| 1989 | 5,746 | 34,888 | 40,634 |
| 1990 | 31,607 | 166,801 | 198,408 |
| 1991 | 32,870 | 128,563 | 161,434 |
| 1992 | 50,477 | 137,089 | 187,566 |
| 1993 | 39,714 | 149,917 | 189,631 |
| 1994 | 38,892 | 351,020 | 389,912 |
| 1995 | 21,497 | 173,347 | 194,844 |
| 1996 | 63,884 | 159,022 | 222,906 |
| 1997 | 132,184 | 85,033 | 217,218 |
| 1998 | 138,777 | 51,183 | 189,960 |
| 1999 | 173,167 | 12,732 | 185,899 |
| 2000 | 172,955 | 18,447 | 191,402 |
| 2001 | 174,019 | 31,910 | 205,929 |
| 2002 | 225,834 | 36,925 | 262,760 |
| 2003 | 211,693 | 74,855 | 286,548 |
| 2004 | 85,396 | 79,051 | 164,447 |
| 2005 | 53,136 | 74,551 | 127,687 |
| 2006 | 292,684 | 112,161 | 404,845 |
| 2007 | 344,900 | 113,193 | 458,093 |
| 2008 | 397,386 | 86,233 | 483,619 |
| 2009 | 357,992 | 36,251 | 394,243 |
| 2010 | 156,197 | 31,475 | 187,673 |
| 2011 | 333,703 | 33,291 | 366,994 |

Table 2. Headboat discard estimates by year and Gulf region.

Figures

Figure 1. SRHS discard rates from all vessels and consistently reporting vessels.





b) West Gulf of Mexico



Figure 2. MRIP, Observer program, and SRHS scaled discard rates.



East Gulf discard rates

b) West Gulf of Mexico

a) East Gulf of Mexico







Headboat discards