

SEDAR 74 Gulf of Mexico Red Snapper Research Track Stock Assessment: Review Workshop Day 1

LaTreese S. Denson Matthew W. Smith



NOAA FISHERIES SEFSC Miami, FL



Outline

- Data Review
 - Stock Definition
 - Life History
 - Data
 - Removals
 - Indices
 - Compositions
- Statistical Catch-at-age Model
 - Base Model Setup
 - Model Fits
 - Sensitivities



Base Model Setup General

- Stock Synthesis version 3.30.20
- Maximum likelihood estimation
- Start year: 1950
- 3 areas, 1 season
- von Bertalanffy Growth forms (fixed)
- SR relationship (assumes no spawner recruit relationship (i.e., Beverton-Holt function with steepness=0.99 as a computational convenience)
- Model ages 0-20+ with age 20 as plus group
- Hybrid selectivity (i.e., length and age base)
- Length based retention
- Data weighting procedures for composition and discards
 - Changes in Lambdas/emphasis factors
 - Dirichlet-multinomial variance inflation

Base Model Setup Model Structure - Spatial

- 3 areas to recruit to, 1 pooled spawning biomass
- Area specific von Bertalanffy growth parameters (fixed)
- Area specific maturity curves (fixed)

Growth Parameters	East	Central	West				
A _{min}	0.25	0.25	0.25	Maturity Baramotors*	East	Central	West
I	L _{Amin} 15.94 17.11 15.94	17 11	15.04	Falameter 5			
⊾Amin		15.94	M _{A50}	1.95	1.95	2.47	
L _{Amax}	85.99	85.43	81.88	M Slope _{A50}	-1.57	-1.57	-1.18
K (year-1)	0.17	0.15	0.14				
					*Sensitivi	ty conducted w/	M₊(SSB₊)



Base Model Setup Model Structure - Temporal

- Time varying apportioned recruits
- Selectivity and retention time blocks to align with changes in management:
 - Selectivity
 - Commercial (trip limits and IFQ)
 - 1950-1992, 1993-2006 and 2007-2019
 - Recreational (bag limits)
 - 1950-1994, 1995-2006 and 2007-2019
 - Retention
 - Based on changes in size limits
 - Commercial
 - 1950 1984, 1985 1994, 1995 2006, 2007 2019
 - Recreational
 - 1950 1989, 1990 1994, 1995 1998, 1999 1999, 2000 2019



Base Model Setup Parameters Estimated: 1828 / 2210

- Initial fishing mortality rates
- ²/₃ Recruitment apportionment parameters (1990-2019)
- Recruitment deviations ($\sigma_R = 0.6$)
- Selectivity parameters
- Dirichlet-multinomial dispersion parameters
- Annual fleet specific fishing mortality rates



Base Model Setup Initial Conditions

- Set initial catch given non-zero starting catch in the model start year
- Initial CV 0.01

	East	West	Central	
HL (pre 1950)	457 mt	265 mt	614 mt	
LL (began 1980)	0 mt	0 mt	0 mt	
Charter (1955)	62,070 fish	386,180 fish	220,670 fish	
Headboat	0	317.220	124130	
Private	24,839	137,920	110,340	



Base Model Setup Recruitment



- Simple deviations estimated
 - Main recruitment deviations start in 1990 given increase in data availability

Apportionment estimation starting in 1975 with variability constrained to a CV of 0.5



Full bias adjustment initiated in 1984



Base Model Setup Commercial Landings CVs Provided vs SS Input



Provided CVs caused model instability, including a lack of convergence, nonsensical estimates of exploitation



Base Model Setup Recreational Landings Provided CVs vs SS Input





Base Model Setup Recreational Landings Provided CVs vs SS Input



High East landings CVs resulted in some model instability.



Base Model Setup Shrimp Trawl Bycatch



"Super period" used to model shrimp bycatch. Median bycatch (dashed line) scaled by annual effort to estimate fleet fishing mortality.



Base Model Setup Indices of Abundance

- Reminder:
 - Scaled CVs to a mean of 0.2
- All indices have Q set as a scaling factor
- Larval index used as an index of spawning biomass not recruitment



Base Model Setup Great Red Snapper Count Inclusion

- Inaugural use of data type for the GOM
- Incorporated as a region-specific absolute survey of age 2+ abundance.
 - Occurring in 2018.
 - Catchability coefficient (q) fixed at 1.
 - Sensitivities suggest model will decrease influence, in order to fit longer term data if q is not fixed at 1
 - Given equal model weight as other data sources (Lambda = 1) - a decision of the ADT



Base Model Setup Fitting Composition Data Reminders

- Blocking needed to account for management activity for commercial and recreational fleets
- No blocking needed for most survey selectivity or catchability given they were derived to account for changes in management and survey design during DW
 - Combined video central used blocking to account for survey design changes
- Length composition used for all directed fleets
 - Matches the way fishery selects by length rather than age
- Length converted age composition used for BLL survey and SEAMAP Fall Trawl Post 2007
 - Ultimate goal: use collected ages from all surveys, where available
- Sample sizes varied based on source
 - Reweighted using Dirichlet Multinomial inflation factors
 - Non iterative effective sample size estimated during parameter estimation
 - Unbiased to clusters of individuals in a sample
 - Accounts for data overdispersion (formally accounted for in assessments using "trips" as n)



Base Model Setup Selectivity Decisions and Functional Forms cont'd

Fleet	Functional Form
GRSC West and Central	Age - Double Normal
GRSC East	Age - Fixed @ 100% age 2+

Unable to use length data as is therefore assumptions are based on gear differences and expert opinion (ADT) regionally:

- Peak selectivity of ages 2-5 in the West and Central.
- Assume zero to 100% selectivity prior to age 2 and 100% for 2+.



Base Model Setup Retention Blocks

- Some discard comp. data available: HL, Shrimp Trawl and LL East in small quantities
- Logistic functional form with 4 parameters based on size: inflection, slope, asymptotic retention, male offset
 - Retention block inflection points based on fleet-specific minimum size changes when no discard data are available
 - Commercial
 - 1950 1984: no minimum size limit regulation in place
 - 1985 1994: 13 inch minimum size limit
 - 1995 2006: 15 inch minimum size limit
 - 2007 2019: 13 inch minimum size limit
 - Recreational
 - 1950 1989: no minimum size limit regulation in place
 - 1990 1994: 13 inch minimum size limit
 - 1995 1998: 15 inch minimum size limit
 - 1999 1999: 18 inch minimum size limit
 - 2000 2019: 16 inch minimum size limit

NOAA FISHERIES

U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 17

Base Model Setup Retention Blocks cont'd

- Slope parameter for all pre-data blocks and base slopes (prior to 2007) fixed as knife-edged all other slopes are estimated for the possibility of sublegal fish
- Asymptote parameter fixed at 1 except for 2007present where it was estimated



Questions About Base Model Setup?



Outline

- Data Review
 - Stock Definition
 - Life History
 - Data
 - Removals
 - Indices
 - Compositions
- Statistical Catch-at-age Model
 - Base Model Setup
 - Model Fits
 - Sensitivities





Landings and Discards



U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 2

Fit to Landings

West area

- Commercial CV = 0.05 until 1995
- Recreational CV = 0.15 until 1995
 - = Observed= Expected

OAA FISHERIES



Fit to Landings

Central area

- Commercial CV = 0.05 until 1995
- Recreational CV = 0.15 until 1995
 - = Observed= Expected



Fit to Landings

East area

- Commercial CV = 0.05 until 1995
- Recreational CV = 0.15 until 1995
- Lambda on Private fleet

600 400

200

= Observed
= Expected



Fit to Discards

West area

Closed season discards generally estimated well due to lack of competing sources of data for the fleet

= Observed
= Expected



Fit to Discards

Central area

Closed season discards generally estimated well due to lack of competing sources of data for the fleet

= Observed
 = Expected
 NOAA FISHERIES



Fit to Discards

East area

Handline and Private closed season discards required upweighting to eliminate "spikes" in the estimated discards. May indicate some model tension in the east

= Observed
 = Expected
 NOAA FISHERIES



Examples of East area spikes



Fit to Bycatch

Upweight imposed on the east area shrimp bycatch to force model to more closely fit the data.

= Observed
 = Expected
 NOAA FISHERIES



Questions about Fits to Landings and Discards





Indices of Relative Abundance



Indices

- West area Indices
- Video and Longline fully recruited
- Larval = SSB
- Summer Trawl Age1
- Fall Trawl Age0







NOAA FISHERIES

U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 33

Summer Trawl Late e . 2.0 2 ~ 1.5 Residual Index . SDNR =1.59 0 1.0 . . $\overline{\mathbf{v}}$ 0.5 4 ကု 0.0 2012 2010 2012 2014 2016 2018 2010 2018 2014 2016 Year Year Summer Trawl Early 4 • 3.0 2 2.5 Residual 2.0 0 SDNR =1.55 Index 1.5 2 1.0 0.5 4 0.0 1985 1990 1995 2000 2005 2005 1985 1990 1995 2000 Year



Year



Year

2000

2005

1995

1990

SDNR =1.43



Year

Indices

- Central area Indices
- Video and Longline fully recruited
- Larval = SSB
- Summer Trawl Age 1
- Fall Trawl Age 0

OAA FISHERIES


Combined Video





Summer Trawl Late ۲ • 2.0 2 1.5 ~ Residual . Index . 0 1.0 • • $\overline{\mathbf{v}}$ 0.5 Ч 0.0 2010 2012 2014 2016 2018 2010 2018 2012 2014 2016 Year Year





SDNR = 2.05



Fall Trawl Late

3.0

2.5

2.0

1.0

0.0 0.5

2008

2010

2012

2014

Year

2016

2018

Index 1.5

Indices

- East area Indices
- Handline, Comm Obs., Video and Longline fully recruited
- Summer Trawl Age1
- Fall Trawl Age0

OAA FISHERIES



Combined Video



NOAA FISHERIES

U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 40

Summer Trawl Late

Year





Index of Absolute Abundance



GRSC index of absolute abundance



| Page 43 tional Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries



Shrimp Effort Time series



Shrimp Effort Time Series



NOAA FISHERIES

U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 45

Questions about Fits to Indices





Length Based Selectivity and Composition





spheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 48

and the second second second



Fleet	Ln(Theta)
LL_W	3.827
LL_E	2.745
LL_C	1.451
Shr_W	0.149
Shr_C	4.799
Shr_E	4.779
GFISHER_C	-1.44
GFISHER_E	-0.95

Length (cm)



Handline Fleets (Double Normal Form)

 All parameters estimated except start and end logit params for base block



West



East



Central

Handline Retained Length Comp Fits

Central



1984 1987 1990 1993 1996 1999 2002 2005 2008 2011 2014 2017





West

1984 1987 1990 1993 1996 1999 2002 2005 2008 2011 2014 2017



				○-4 • 0.1 ● 4
10 -				
05 -				
00 -				
95 -	• •			
90 -	• • • •	·		
85 -	• • • •	0	••	• •
80 -	· • • • •	0	• • 🔴	◦ ● • • • ○ ○ ○ ○ ○ • •
75 -	000 • •	0	o · •	0 0 0 • 0 • 0 • 0 • • • • • •
70 -	$\bigcirc \circ \circ \bullet \circ$	0	•••	$\bullet \bullet \circ \bullet \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet $
65 -	$\bigcirc \cdot \bullet \cdot \circ$	0	000	$\bigcirc \bigcirc \bullet \bigcirc \bullet \bigcirc \bullet \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bullet \bigcirc \circ \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \circ \bigcirc \circ $
60 -	0 00 0 ·	۰	•••	· · · · • • • • · · · · · · · • • • • •
55 -	• • • • •	0	•••	$\circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \cdot \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \circ \circ$
50 -	$\textcircled{\bullet} \bullet \bullet \textcircled{\circ} \circ$	0	•••	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
45 -	$\bigcirc \circ \circ \circ \circ \bigcirc$	0	•••	$\circ \circ $
40 -	$\bullet \bigcirc \circ \bullet \bullet$	٠	• • •	$\bullet \bullet \circ \bullet \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \cdot \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$
35 -	00000	•	000	
30 -	$\bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bullet$	۰		$\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \circ \bullet \bullet \bullet \circ \circ$
25 -	• •	0		• • • • • •
20 -				•

East

OS

neg

1984 1987 1990 1993 1996 1999 2002 2005 2008 2011 2014 2017

Year



U.S.^YDepartment of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | WOAA Fisheries | Page 51

Longline fleets (logistic form)

- Central mirrored to the West
- All parameters estimated for all blocks



West



East



Central

Longline Retained Length Comp Fits



pos

Charter Boat Fleets (Double Normal Form)

- East mirrored to Central
- All parameters estimated for all blocks







East



Central



OS

heg



UILIILU

Headboat Fleets (Double Normal Form)

- East mirrored to Central
- All parameters estimated for all blocks



West



East



Central

Headboat Retained Length Comp Fits



Private Rec. Fleets (Double Normal Form)

- East mirrored to Central
- All parameters estimated for all blocks



West



East



Central

Private Rec. Retained Length Comp Fits



U.S.YDepartment of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | YNOAA Fisheries | Page 59

neg

Video Surveys (Logistic Form)

- All parameters estimated.
- Only central used time blocks



East





pos Video Survey Length Comp Fits heg Central West East



Summer Trawl Late (3 Node Cubic Spline Form)

 Node location set separately for each area based on data quantiles.

0.1





Summer Trawl (Late) Length Comp Fits



pos

Summer Trawl Early (3 Node Cubic Spline Form)

 Node location set based on data quantiles.





Summer Trawl (Early) Length Comp Fits

Central





pos neg

=

East

Fall Trawl Early (Negative Slope Logistic Form)

 Slope constrained to be less than 0 in model specifications.





Fall Trawl (Early) Length Comp Fits Central West





pos neg

East

Comm. RFOP Survey (Double Normal Form)

 Mirrored to the commercial handline east fleet.





Comm. RFOP Survey Length Comp Fits

Central

West



pos

neg



Shrimp Bycatch (Negative Slope Logistic)

• Slope constrained to be less than 0 in model specifications.





Shrimp Bycatch Length Comp Fits



Questions about Fits to Length Composition?




Age Based Selectivity and Composition





istration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 74

Bottom Longline Survey (Logistic Form)

• All parameters estimated.

10

Age (yr)

5

es'

15

<u>,</u>

0.8

0.6

0.4

0.2

0.0

0



Bottom Longline Survey Age Comp Fits



West

pos

heg

East



Fall Trawl Late (Empirical Random Walk Form)

- Estimated for ages 0-4
- Fixed at 0 for ages 5+

10

Age (yr)

5

es

15

<u>,</u>

0.8

0.6

0.4

0.2

0.0

0





U.S.^YDepartment of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | WOAA Fisheries | Page 78

Year

GRSC (Double Normal or Fixed Form)

15

- East fixed at 100% selectivity for ages 2+
- For W & C ages 0 and 1 Fixed at 0% selectivity

10

Age (yr)

AS

<u>,</u>

0.8

0.6

0.4

0.2

0.0

0



Questions about Fits to Age Composition





Length Based Retention Functions



Retention Functions Setup Refresher

- All 4 parameter logistic form with the slope, inflection and asymptote parameters considered.
- When no discard composition data was available inflections were fixed at the minimum size.
- Base slope was fixed at "knife-edged" while all other slopes were estimated to accommodate sublegal fish occurring in the retained composition
- Asymptote fixed at 1 except for 2007-present where it was estimated



Commercial Handline Retention





Commercial Handline Discard Comp



NOAA FISHERIES

pos

Commercial Longline Retention



Magnitude of estimated regulatory discards exceeded expectations but supported by composition

NOAA FISHERIES

Commercial Longline Discard Comp



DS





Length (cm)

80



Recreational Charter Boat Retention





Recreational Headboat Retention





Recreational Private Boat Retention





Retention Summary

- In general retention functions with estimated parameters followed reasonable and predictable forms.
- For recreational fleets, model estimated significant regulatory discarding for all east fleets and the central headboat fleet; however, these estimates are not currently supported by discard composition.
- Regulatory discards of commercially caught fish was more prevalent in the east and in the Longline fleets were lack of IFQ may be a driving factor.
- Estimates of asymptote parameters could benefit from increased discard composition collection or informative priors derived from independent studies.



Questions about Retention Functions and Discard Composition





Model Derived Quantities





Stock Recruit and Apportionment



Stock Recruitment

 Model essentially estimates average recruitment.

 Deviations have become increasingly positive with time.



Spawning output (relative to B₀)



Recruitment

- Upward trend in recruitment deviations.
- Generally well estimated with the exception of the earliest and terminal years.



Recruitment deviation variance



NOAA FISHERIES

2008 Recruitment

Evidence of poor recruitment seen across assessment areas (Central Shown).





Recruits



Year





Recruits by area

Area 1 = East Area 2 = Central Area 3 = West





Area 1 = East

Fraction of total Age-0 recruits

Questions about Stock Recruitment and Apportionment





Biomass and Fishing Mortality



U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 10

Spawning Biomass Gulf wide





Spawning Biomass Gulf wide Comparison

- Similar biomass and depletion trajectories between current and past assessment
- Initial differences likely due to change of start year between models





By Area Spawning Biomass and Relative Biomass



Area 1 = East Area 2 = Central Area 3 = West



East Area Trend

Steep decline from 2011 to 2012 associated with highly uncertain private discards for 2011 which resulted in a very high estimate of fishing mortality rate







Area-specific SSB Comparisons



Age 2+ Exploitation

Reasonable exploitation rates through time given history of fishing. '81 and '83 estimates tied to highly uncertain recreational landings





Fishing Mortality by Fleet

Continuous F



Year
Age 2+ Exploitation

Recreational '81 and '83 estimates should be reevaluated and potentially smoothed over



Year



Questions about Biomass and Fishing Mortality



Outline

- Data Review
 - Stock Definition
 - Life History
 - Data
 - Removals
 - Indices
 - Compositions
- Statistical Catch-at-age Model
 - Base Model Setup
 - Model Fits
 - Sensitivities



Sensitivities - Dynamic Maturity

Based on suggestions from the LHWG time varying maturity sensitivities were conducted.

1. Using separate parameter blocks for changes in A_{50} and A_{slope} over three time periods.

Year	Parameter	East	Central	West
1970	M _{A50}	1.49	1.49	1.71
	M Slope _{A50}	-2.39	-2.39	-1.99
1991	M _{A50}	1.39	1.39	1.51
	M Slope _{A50}	-3.61	-3.61	-3.21
2009	M _{A50}	1.49	1.49	1.71
	M Slope _{A50}	-2.39	-2.39	-1.99

2. A_{50} and A_{slope} as functions of Spawning Stock Biomass (i.e., fish mature at younger ages when stock sizes are low)

Py = Pbase +Pt*Ey

Where: y = year Py = Maturity slope or A50 in year, y Pbase = Base Maturity slope or A50 (1950) Pt = Scaling parameter (i.e., effect size) Ey = Log(SSBy/SSB0) in year, y



Sensitivities - Dynamic Maturity







Sensitivities - GRSC - Catchability Coefficient (Q)





Sensitivities - GRSC - Weighting



NOAA FISHERIES

U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 115

Sensitivities - GRSC - Weighting





Sensitivities - GRSC - Selectivity

Due to concerns surrounding GRSC length comp data, two sensitivities were conducted.

- 1. No GRSC estimates used in the model.
- GRSC estimates are included in the assessment model and the selectivity is assumed to be 100% of all fish age-2+.



Sensitivities - GRSC - Selectivity





Operational Assessment Considerations



Operational Assessment

- Data will be updated and recompiled following best practices determined during the research track
- Diagnostic analyses to be considered
 - Jitter analysis
 - Residual analysis
 - Runs test
 - Profile analysis of SR parameters
 - Retrospective analysis
 - Hindcasting



Operational Assessment

- Once model is finalized
 - Projections will be conducted in order to establish biological reference points, estimate stock status and project yield.
- Sensitivity analysis will be considered and conducted as necessary



Questions?



0



U.S. Department of Commerce | National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration | NOAA Fisheries | Page 122

•

•