

# **SEDAR**

## **SouthEast Data, Assessment, and Review**

*South Atlantic Fishery Management Council  
Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council  
Caribbean Fishery Management Council  
NOAA Fisheries  
Atlantic States Marine Fisheries Commission  
Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission*

% SAFMC  
1 Southpark Circle #306  
Charleston SC 29407  
Phone (843) 571-4366  
Fax (843) 769-4520

---

### **SEDAR Steering Committee April 19, 2006 Conference Call**

### **Discussion**

*10:00 a.m. Wednesday, April 19 2006*

1. Introductions and Agenda Review
2. Approval of Minutes, August 2005 meeting  
SEDARSC\_Aug05 SummaryMins.doc
3. SEDAR 10 Gag Grouper Review Panel Composition

The Steering Committee agreed to evaluate an alternative review panel consisting of 3 CIE appointed independent reviewers for SEDAR 9. The intent of the all CIE review is to ensure clear independence of the review panel in accordance with general trends in scientific reviews. The committee must decide whether this change will be permanent, and if not, the committee must decide how review panels will be composed for future SEDARs. A decision is necessary at this meeting to allow preparation time for SEDAR 10, Gulf and South Atlantic gag grouper.

The SEDAR Steering Committee considered this issue in some detail at previous meetings, most recently August 2005, when the committee decided to delay any decisions until the SEDAR 9 Review Panel was convened and evaluated. Members are directed to the briefing materials for the August 2005 meeting for a general discussion of this issue. An evaluation of the SEDAR 9 review panel is provided below.

#### **Evaluation of SEDAR 9 Review**

Procedure. The SEDAR 9 review panel called for a chair appointed by the SEFSC director. The intent was for the Chair to be a NOAA Fisheries employee from outside the Southeast, and likely an employee of another regional science center. However, securing a chair for SEDAR 9 proved extremely difficult. Few qualified persons in other science centers had the time available to serve as chair. We may experience difficulty identifying workshop chairs in the future. Options include requesting a chair from the CIE pool or

making arrangements to secure professional facilitators to serve as chairs. Both will require additional resources, and it is not certain whether or not the CIE can provide additional experts.

Workshop Performance. The CIE appointed experts are clearly independent and highly qualified to provide a thorough technical review. All reviewers came to the workshop well prepared and briefed on the assessments. It did not appear that any more time than usual was required to explain data collection programs or other regionally-specific issues. No one associated with the review expressed any reservations or dissatisfaction with the CIE review panel.

#### 4. SEDAR Schedule Review

SEDAR benchmark workshop numbering was modified to incorporate shark assessment activities.

SEDAR #	SPECIES	Year <sup>1</sup>	Current Status <sup>2</sup>
1	SAFMC Red Porgy	2002	FINAL
2	SAFMC Vermilion Snapper/Black Seabass	2003	FINAL
3	SAFMC Yellowtail Snapper ASMFC Atlantic Menhaden / Croaker	2003	FINAL
4	SAFMC Tilefish, Snowy Grouper	2004	FINAL
5	SAFMC & GMFMC King Mackerel	2004	FINAL
6	FL (SAFMC/GMFMC) Goliath Grouper & Hogfish Snapper	2004	FINAL
7	GMFMC Red Snapper	2004	FINAL
8	CFMC Yellowtail Snapper, Spiny Lobster REVIEW: FL (SAFMC/GMFMC) Spiny Lobster	2005	FINAL
9	GMFMC Vermilion/Greater Amberjack/Gray Trigger	2005 F	ONGOING
10	SAFMC & GMFMC Gag	2006 S	ONGOING
11	Large Coastal Sharks	2006	ONGOING
12	GMFMC Red Grouper	2006 F	PLANNING
13	Small Coastal Sharks	2007	SCHEDULED
14	CFMC Yellowfin Gouper, Mutton Snapper, Queen Conch	2007 S	SCHEDULED
15	SAFMC greater amberjack, White Grunt	2007 F	SCHEDULED
16	GMFMC Yellowedge grouper, Tilefish	2008 S	SCHEDULED
17	SA Spanish Mackerel/Black Sea Bass	2008 F	SCHEDULED
18	SA and GOM red drum.	2009 S	SCHEDULED
19	Hogfish. Atlantic YTS (update or benchmark) Review ASMFC menhanden and Croaker.	2009 F	SCHEDULED
20	GMFMC Red Snapper	2010 S	SCHEDULED
21	CFMC Yellowtail, spiny lobster, queen conch	2010 F	SCHEDULED

Goliath grouper is scheduled for update in 2006. The SEFSC has indicated that the current SEDAR analytical load, including major assessments of gag and red grouper in 2006, delays in

completing SEDAR 9 that have pushed activities into 2006, delays in addressing king mackerel mixing, coupled with a heavy load of ICCAT work and continued analytical requests relative to red snapper make it impractical to develop a goliath grouper update in 2006.

SEDAR 10 will address SA/GOM gag. The update schedule indicates SA/GOM gag and red grouper will be updated in 2010. Red grouper will now be assessed in SEDAR 12, so the schedule of an update should be reconsidered. Further, it is unlikely that manpower will be available to update SA/GOM gag and GOM red grouper in the same year that GOM red snapper is undergoing a new benchmark.

The steering committee should reconsider the update schedule.

1) Goliath Grouper

2) Update 8 - drop red grouper?

SEDAR Update #	Species	Benchmark SEDAR#	Scheduled Completion	Status
1	SA Black Seabass	2	4/22/2005	FINAL
2	SA Red Porgy	1	May 25 2006	Ongoing
3	SA/GM King Mackerel <sup>1</sup>	5	Fall 2006	Scheduled
4	Goliath Grouper	6	Late 2006	Scheduled
5	SA Vermillion Snapper	2	2007	Scheduled
6	GM Greater Amberjack/Vermilion Snapper/Gray Triggerfish	9	2009	Scheduled
7	SA Goldentile/Snowy Grouper	4	2009	Scheduled
8	SA/GM Gag & Red Grouper	10	2010	Scheduled
9	FL Spiny Lobster	8	2010	Scheduled

1. King Mackerel Update. The king mackerel assessment model approved by the SEDAR 5 Review Panel will be run by SEFSC analysts once a stock migratory unit definition is approved by the Gulf of Mexico and South Atlantic Fishery Management Councils.

## 5. SEDAR Update Process Review

SEDAR acknowledges two separate classes of assessments : “benchmarks” and “updates”. Benchmark assessments are the primary focus of SEDAR. Council SSCs are expected to take a major role in benchmark assessments through a process very similar to the previous assessment panel approach. A review of the update process was requested by the Gulf Council. The steering committee may also wish to clarify the process at this time.

From the SEDAR Guidelines, process for assessment updates:

Once an assessment is approved through SEDAR, the basic framework of input data and model configuration may be updated in the future by adding additional years of data. Minor modifications and changes to input data and modeling techniques may also be incorporated, although in all instances a strict update, defined as incorporation of additional data into the previous framework, should be prepared. The SEDAR Steering Committee will approve and schedule requests for assessment updates and determine the entity which will take lead in conducting the assessment. The Council or Councils involved in the update assessment shall

make appointments to the update workshop panel in accordance with the SEDAR appointment guidelines. Oversight and review of assessment updates, including determination of acceptable changes and modification of the benchmark assessment, will be provided by each Council's SSC.

Prior to conducting an update, the SSC shall provide a written report to the Council and SEDAR Coordinator describing the terms of the update. Following the update, the SSC shall provide a written Consensus Summary and Advisory Report to the Council and SEDAR Coordinator detailing their review of the update. The Consensus Summary and Advisory Report should follow the same format as those prepared by SEDAR review panels. Councils shall appoint panelists for the update workshop in accordance with the SEDAR guidelines for participation. Each Council is allowed latitude in developing a more detailed process to conduct SEDAR assessment updates.

All documentation standards of SEDAR workshops apply to assessment updates. Working papers, Assessment Reports, and the Consensus Summary and Advisory Report shall be provided to the SEDAR coordinator for inclusion in the Administrative Record and website posting.

So far two assessment updates have been prepared, South Atlantic black sea bass and South Atlantic red porgy. The South Atlantic SSC decided to consider data issues and update bounds through scoping conference calls held approximately 6 months prior to the assessment due date. Approximately 2-3 mos prior to the due date a 2-3 day workshop is held to review the update assessment and prepare a consensus report.

Update aspects that are not clearly specified include who should chair update assessment workshops and what type of documentation is required.

One recommendation is to model the update approach after the assessment group approach used by the Councils prior to SEDAR. The actual update workshop will be chaired by a representative of the SSC. The lead assessment agency will prepare documentation of the input data, assessment models, and other required supporting analyses. The update workshop panel will develop consensus and advisory reports with content similar to benchmark assessment reports. The SSC will provide written or oral reports to the council, consistent with their reports on pre-SEDAR assessments and Council procedures.

## 6. Management Activities Update

## 7. Research and Monitoring Report Update

Most of desired information on sampling intensity is tabulated. Current efforts are directed at describing the various data collection programs.

## 8. Schedule Next Meeting

Tuesday, August 1, 9:00 am - 5:00 pm

Continue into Wednesday, August 2, 9:00 am - 12:00 pm ?

Location: San Juan, Puerto Rico. Old San Juan area.

Agenda Items:

Schedule SEDAR 22 & 23, 2011; SEDAR 24 & 25, 2012

9. Other Business

10. Adjourn

*12:00 p.m.*