## Draft Working Document

# Red snapper otoliths selected for aging at NMFS Panama City Laboratory and discussion of future sampling targets 

G.R. Fitzhugh, L.A. Lombardi-Carlson, R.J. Allman and B.K. Barnett

National Marine Fisheries Service

Southeast Fisheries Science Center 3500 Delwood Beach Road
Panama City, FL 32408

April, 2004

Panama City Laboratory
Contribution Series 04-02

## Otoliths aged for 1999 assessment:

While there have been several red snapper growth studies that provided size-at-age estimates and growth curve parameters, additional annual information on direct age composition from otoliths is increasingly called for. As a result, expanded efforts in port collection of otoliths began in 1998 (see annual collection reports: Allman et al. 2000, Fitzhugh et al. 1999, Lombardi-Carlson et al. 2001, 2003, and Mikulas et al. 2002). It was also suggested that archived red snapper otoliths from prior years should be aged to generate annual age composition data sets (Reef Fish Stock Assessment Panel 1999).

During earlier red snapper assessments, the Goodyear probabilistic method was commonly used to generate catch-at-age from length data. This approach was also used in the last "full" assessment, but the resulting age compositions were additionally compared to age compositions based on empirical otolith aging results (Schirripa and Legault 1999). These empirical age compositions were derived from a 1998 data set from the Panama City Laboratory reflecting broader age sampling by gear and location and a from a dataset from Louisiana State University for the commercial handline west sector for 1995-1997 (Schirripa and Legault 1999).

## Otolith collections archived:

Collections from federally sponsored sampling programs (including the Trip Interview Program, Beaufort Headboat Survey, Marine Recreational Fisheries Statistical SurveyMRFSS, and various scientific surveys) were archived at the Panama City Laboratory, largely beginning in 1991 and expanded in 1998 (see summary in Table 1). Before 1991, annual otolith collection efforts were minimal-the exception being 1980 (Table 1). Augmented by the large increase in collection efforts beginning in 1998, the total archived collection through 2002 is about 60,000 red snapper otoliths from about 5000 collections (Table 1).

In 1998, several sources contributed to the collection of red snapper otoliths but from 1999 onward, the TIP program provided the majority (Figure 1). As a result, most otoliths were taken from the commercial sector which is the main sector targeted by the

TIP program. Red snapper comprised a large share of the otoliths received at the Panama City Laboratory in 1998 and 1999 (Figure 2). From 2000 to 2002, other species were collected in increasing numbers while the numbers of red snapper declined somewhat (Figure 2). However, red snapper remains the largest component by species, of the annual otolith totals. For further breakdown, see annual collection reports (Allman et al. 2000, Fitzhugh et al. 1999, Lombardi-Carlson et al. 2001, 2003, and Mikulas et al. 2002).


Figure 1. Percent of red snapper otoliths annually collected by the principal sampling programs. The category denoted as "other" primarily includes scientific survey samples.


Figure 2. Annual numbers of otoliths from red snapper and from species other than red snapper, archived at Panama City since 1998. Total species represented: $\mathrm{n}=33$ in 1998, $\mathrm{n}=31$ in 1999, $\mathrm{n}=39$ in 2000, $\mathrm{n}=61$ in 2001 and $\mathrm{n}=55$ in 2002. Besides red snapper, other species targeted for aging in the last five years include gag, red grouper, scamp, yellowedge grouper, vermilion snapper, yellowtail snapper, gray triggerfish, king- and Spanish mackerel.

Table 1. Summary of Gulf of Mexico red snapper otoliths archived and aged at the Panama City Laboratory. All red snapper otoliths must be sectioned to be aged. The category of whole otoliths remaining intact plus the category of sectioned otoliths yields the total number available from a particular year. The category "selected by fish size" includes otoliths selected for aging for different purposes including characterization of size-based reproductive traits and tournament-sampled fish. See text for criteria on selection of otolith samples for aging. The 2002 tally of 5,187 otoliths aged, includes 736 Florida recreational samples (originally received at Panama City) that will be included in the state share of the Fin Data base in the future.

| Year | \# of Whole <br> Otoliths Remaining | \# of sectioned otoliths | Total \# of red snapper otoliths | Sub-Sampled for aging? | \# sectioned aged that were considered selected for size | $\begin{aligned} & \% \text { Bias } \\ & \text { per year } \end{aligned}$ | \# sectioned aged randomly |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1980 |  | 339 | 339 | No |  |  | 339 |
| 1981 | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 1983 | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 1991 |  | 1,148 | 1,148 | No | 16 | 1 | 1,132 |
| 1992 |  | 1,369 | 1,369 | No | 22 | 2 | 1,347 |
| 1993 | 1,348 | 2,445 | 3,793 | Yes |  | 0 | 2,445 |
| 1994 | 659 | 1,894 | 2,553 | Yes |  | 0 | 1,894 |
| 1995 |  | 801 | 801 | No | 151 | 23 | 650 |
| 1996 |  | 238 | 238 | No |  | 0 | 238 |
| 1997 |  | 248 | 248 | No | 6 | 2 | 242 |
| 1998 | 7,916 | 5,212 | 13,128 | Yes | 883 | 20 | 4,329 |
| 1999 | 6,388 | 5,191 | 11,579 | Yes | 448 | 9 | 4,743 |
| 2000 | 3,089 | 3,783 | 6,872 | Yes | 16 | 0 | 3,767 |
| 2001 | 4,216 | 3,431 | 7,647 | Yes | 33 | 1 | 3,398 |
| 2002 | 4,800 | 5,335 | 10,135 | Yes | 148 | 3 | 5,187 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total | 28,416 | 31,434 | 59,852 |  | 1,723 | 6 | 29,711 |

## Otoliths selected for aging for next full assessment (scheduled 2004):

Beginning in 1998, there was a substantial increase in efforts to process and age red snapper at the Panama City Laboratory in line with the increase in port collections. However, in balance with other demands, including a need to continue processing previously archived red snapper otoliths, annual sub-sampling of red snapper otoliths was deemed necessary and, looking forward to the next full stock assessment, we developed a working strategy. Collections of biological samples (i.e., number of otoliths and gonads collected at each intercept as opposed to individual fish records) have been logged in as they have been received at the laboratory. After compiling collections at the end of each year, an annual sub-sample of otoliths was selected based on stratified random draws
from the logged collections. In accordance with the red snapper fishery, approximately $50 \%$ of the collections were targeted for sub-sampling from the western gulf, and $50 \%$ from the eastern gulf. In addition, we attempted to randomly select collections that represented all fishing sectors as reflected in the landings (categorized as: private recreational, recreational charter boat, recreational headboat, commercial hook-and-line, and commercial longline). Ideally, this would have comprised a draw of about $50 \%$ recreational and $50 \%$ commercial samples for the overall Gulf of Mexico. Unfortunately, few recreational samples were available in comparison to commercial samples. In particular, commercial hook-and-line samples have dominated the red snapper otolith collections over the years (Allman et al. 2000, Fitzhugh et al. 1999, Lombardi-Carlson et al. 2001, 2003, and Mikulas et al. 2002). We set an annual target of about 4000 red snapper otoliths as a basis to then draw stratified sub-samples (1998-present). With this target, we could then achieve roughly equal representation between commercial and recreational sources and between eastern and western gulf regions each year (Table 2). From earlier years, we attempted to age all available otoliths, but subsamples from 1993 and 1994 collections were based largely on an effort to achieve parity in representation between the eastern and western gulf. Once collections were drawn, an annual database of the individual fish records was generated and the aging begun. At the completion of the annual aging session, ages were entered and the database was verified against original collection records (provided by port agents). In addition to these sub-samples representing port collections, red snapper otoliths from scientific surveys, particularly the NMFS Pascagoula long-line survey, were selected for aging.

Both random and size-selected red snapper otoliths were aged. However, for size and age characterization of each fishery only ages from randomly collected fish were used. Ages from size-selected fish, tournament fish and scientific-survey fish were included for sizebased reproductive parameters and growth curve analysis. Typically, selected samples represent a low percentage of the total processed (about 5\%, Table 1) but were higher in some years where there was a directed effort to obtain reproductive samples from largersized fish (e.g., 1998, Table 1).

## Reconsideration of otolith targets within strata:

In September 2003, the available red snapper ages were reviewed and the SEFSC Sustainable Fisheries Division (SFD, Miami) recommended that processing and reading be maximized by the following stratification: year, 2-month wave (as defined by MRFSS sampling protocol), region (1-Texas, 2-Louisiana, and 3-eastern Gulf representing landings from Mississippi through West Florida) and mode. Modes represented were recreational-1-charterboat (CP), 2-head boat (HB), and 3-private boat (PR) (all hook-and-line) and commercial-4-commercial hook-and-line (HL) and 5-commercial longline (LL). This effectively brings the total to 90 cells for the Gulf of Mexico each year and the potential for 1080 cells over the years 1991-2002 (Table 2). In that not all otoliths could be processed and read in the remaining time before the scheduled assessment, SFD recommended that at least 100 otoliths be read per stratum.

By processing and aging an additional 3249 otoliths between September 2003 and March 2004, we did meet the 100-per-cell criterion where possible, however, the results of Table 2 indicate that many of the possible cells $(\mathrm{n}=1080)$ remained empty based upon the available archived samples. In the commercial sector, the 100-per-cell criterion was met 61 times, largely during years 1999-2002 for the Louisiana and East regions. For the recreational sector, this objective was less often achievable as the 100-per-cell criterion was possible to meet 48 times (all years; Table 2 ). The criterion was only sporadically met during the earlier years, principally 1993-1994.

Table 2. Results of 100-per-cell objective of processing otoliths from an available archive. "Yes" means samples were processed and aged and "No" refers to unprocessed samples remaining within the archive. A. refers to recreational tallies and B. refers to commercial tallies.
A. Recreational

| Mode |  | Year | Jan/Feb <br> 1 |  | $\underset{2}{\mathrm{Mar} / \mathrm{Apr}}$ |  | $\left\lvert\,\right.$ |  | $\begin{array}{\|c\|c\|c\|}  & \text { July/Aug } \\ \text { yes no } \\ \hline \end{array}$ |  | $$ |  | $$ |  | Grand Total Yes | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Grand Total } \\ & \text { No } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CP | EAST | 1991 |  |  | 27 |  | 24 |  | 100 |  | 88 |  | 8 |  | 247 |  |
|  |  | 1992 |  |  | 65 |  | 74 |  | 97 |  | 81 |  | 39 |  | 356 |  |
|  |  | 1993 |  |  | 17 |  | 93 |  | 157 |  | 142 |  | 7 |  | 416 |  |
|  |  | 1994 |  |  | 37 |  | 133 |  | 170 |  | 112 |  | 30 |  | 482 |  |
|  |  | 1995 |  |  | 46 |  | 162 |  | 109 |  | 49 |  |  |  | 366 |  |
|  |  | 1996 |  |  | 4 |  | 78 |  | 20 |  | 2 |  |  |  | 104 |  |
|  |  | 1997 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 18 |  | 39 |  |  |  | 57 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  | 110 | 22 | 313 | 1,220 | 442 | 2,403 |  |  | 865 | 3,645 |
|  |  | 1999 | 36 |  | 100 | 195 | 220 | 429 | 264 | 708 | 74 |  |  |  | 694 | 1,332 |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  | 129 |  | 264 | 1 | 69 |  | 47 |  |  |  | 509 | 1 |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  | 100 |  | 142 |  | 93 |  | 78 |  |  |  | 413 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  | 110 |  | 395 |  | 295 |  | 337 |  | 1 |  | 1,138 |  |
|  | LA | 1998 |  |  |  |  | 20 |  | 99 | 151 | 19 |  |  |  | 138 | 151 |
|  |  | 1999 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 100 | 97 |  |  |  |  | 101 | 97 |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3 |  |  |  |  |  | 3 |  |
|  | TX | 1991 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 258 |  | 252 |  | 18 |  | 528 |  |
|  |  | 1992 | 207 |  |  |  |  |  | 218 |  | 62 |  |  |  | 487 |  |
|  |  | 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 132 |  | 90 |  |  |  | 222 |  |
| HB | EAST | 1991 |  |  |  |  | 11 |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |  | 20 |  |
|  |  | 1992 |  |  | 8 |  | 42 |  | 16 |  | 8 |  | 4 |  | 78 |  |
|  |  | 1993 | 10 |  | 49 |  | 101 | 11 | 71 |  | 19 |  | 26 |  | 276 | 11 |
|  |  | 1994 | 15 |  | 36 | 22 | 61 |  | 70 |  | 90 |  |  |  | 272 | 22 |
|  |  | 1995 |  |  |  |  | 9 |  | 2 |  | 1 |  |  |  | 12 |  |
|  |  | 1996 |  |  |  |  | 58 |  | 49 |  | 10 |  |  |  | 117 |  |
|  |  | 1997 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 22 |  | 52 |  | 24 |  | 99 |  |
|  |  | 1998 | 10 |  | 47 |  | 262 | 62 | 114 | 354 | 99 | 118 |  |  | 532 | 534 |
|  |  | 1999 | 10 |  | 86 |  | 148 | 58 | 100 | 18 | 44 | 6 |  |  | 388 | 82 |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  |  |  | 52 |  | 31 |  | 69 |  |  |  | 152 |  |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  | 1 |  | 37 |  | 112 |  | 73 |  |  |  | 223 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  | 10 |  | 70 |  | 77 |  | 65 |  |  |  | 222 |  |
|  | LA | 1993 | 62 |  | 88 |  | 100 | 9 | 100 | 74 | 10 |  | 31 |  | 391 | 83 |
|  |  | 1994 | 28 |  | 64 | 22 | 39 |  | 53 |  | 55 |  |  |  | 239 | 22 |
|  |  | 1995 |  |  |  |  | 4 |  |  |  |  |  | 6 |  | 10 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  | 36 |  | 40 |  |  |  |  |  | 76 |  |
|  |  | 1999 | 11 |  | 30 |  | 34 |  | 25 |  |  |  |  |  | 100 |  |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  |  |  | 92 |  | 77 |  | 31 |  |  |  | 200 |  |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  |  |  | 17 |  | 22 |  | 12 |  |  |  | 51 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  | 5 |  | 24 |  | 21 | 1 | 18 |  |  |  | 68 | 1 |
|  | TX | 1991 |  |  | 11 |  |  |  | 45 |  | 40 |  | 7 |  | 103 |  |
|  |  | 1992 |  |  | 3 |  | 1 |  |  |  | 22 |  |  |  | 26 |  |
|  |  | 1993 | 102 | 148 | 102 | 76 | 102 | 59 | 103 | 104 | 101 | 67 | 19 |  | 529 | 454 |
|  |  | 1994 | 23 |  |  |  | 16 |  | 89 |  | 43 |  | 17 |  | 188 |  |
|  |  | 1998 | 22 |  |  |  | 319 | 295 | 127 | 903 | 24 |  |  |  | 492 | 1,198 |
|  |  | 1999 |  |  | 90 |  | 66 |  | 18 |  |  |  |  |  | 174 |  |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  | 4 |  | 13 |  | 22 |  | 14 |  |  |  | 53 |  |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  |  |  | 5 |  | 18 |  |  |  |  |  | 23 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  | 25 |  | 13 |  | 14 |  | 5 |  |  |  | 57 |  |
| $\overline{\text { PR }}$ | EAST | 1992 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 145 |  | 128 | 17 |  |  | 273 | 17 |
|  |  | 1999 |  |  |  |  | 70 |  | 536 | 244 | 2 |  |  |  | 608 | 244 |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  | 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  |  |  | 22 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 22 | 1 |
|  | LA | 1998 |  |  |  |  | 15 |  | 167 |  | 42 |  |  |  | 224 |  |
|  |  | 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 82 |  |  |  |  |  | 82 |  |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  |  |  | 2 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 3 |  |
|  | TX | 1993 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 24 |  |  |  |  |  | 24 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | TOTAL | 536 | 148 | 1,298 | 315 | 3,557 | 946 | 4,918 | 3,875 | 2,991 | 2,611 | 237 |  | 13,537 | 7,895 |

## B. Commercial

| Gear <br> LL |  | Year | Jan/Feb <br> 1 |  | $\underset{2}{\mathrm{Mar} / \mathrm{Apr}}$ |  | May/June 3 |  | $\underset{4}{\text { July/Aug }}$ |  | $\underset{5}{\text { Sept/Oct }}$ |  | Nov/Dec <br> 6 |  | Grand Total Yes | Grand Total <br> No |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | yes | no | yes | no | yes | no | yes | no | yes | no | yes | no |  |  |
|  | EAST | 1991 |  |  | 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 13 |  |
|  |  | 1992 |  |  |  |  | 4 |  | 3 |  | 8 |  |  |  | 15 |  |
|  |  | 1993 |  |  | 4 |  | 4 |  | 18 |  |  |  | 5 |  | 31 |  |
|  |  | 1994 |  |  | 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9 |  |
|  |  | 1995 |  |  |  |  | 5 |  | 8 |  | 6 |  | 2 |  | 21 |  |
|  |  | 1996 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6 |  |  |  | 6 |  |
|  |  | 1997 |  |  | 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 27 |  |  |  | 27 |  |
|  |  | 1999 | 46 |  | 38 |  |  |  |  |  | 27 |  |  |  | 111 |  |
|  |  | 2000 | 28 |  | 48 |  |  |  |  |  | 38 |  | 21 |  | 135 |  |
|  |  | 2001 | 2 |  |  |  | 26 |  | 38 |  | 10 |  | 16 |  | 92 |  |
|  |  | 2002 | 38 |  | 22 |  | 43 |  | 55 |  | 9 |  | 19 |  | 186 |  |
| LA |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 242 |  |  |  | 242 |  |
|  |  | 1999 | 40 |  | 36 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 76 |  |
|  |  | 2000 |  |  | 147 |  |  |  |  |  | 103 |  | 66 |  | 316 |  |
|  |  | 2001 | 108 |  | 24 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 23 |  | 155 |  |
|  |  | 2002 | 40 |  | 102 |  | 131 |  | 23 |  |  |  |  |  | 296 |  |
| TX |  | 1993 |  |  | 9 |  |  |  | 22 |  |  |  |  |  | 31 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 116 |  |  |  | 116 |  |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  | 36 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 36 |  |
|  |  | 2002 |  |  | 24 |  | 40 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 64 |  |
| HL | EAST | 1991 |  |  | 88 |  | 54 |  | 48 |  |  |  |  |  | 190 |  |
|  |  | 1992 | 109 |  |  |  | 19 |  | 4 |  | 6 |  |  |  | 138 |  |
|  |  | 1993 | 11 |  | 2 |  | 65 |  | 28 |  | 21 |  | 35 |  | 162 |  |
|  |  | 1994 | 13 |  | 37 |  | 36 |  | 27 |  | 50 |  | 36 |  | 199 |  |
|  |  | 1995 | 29 |  | 99 |  | 28 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 156 |  |
|  |  | 1996 |  |  | 2 |  | 4 |  | 3 |  |  |  |  |  | 9 |  |
|  |  | 1997 |  |  | 33 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 33 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 239 | 489 |  |  | 239 | 489 |
|  |  | 1999 | 362 | 311 | 199 | 526 |  |  |  |  | 109 | 636 | 100 | 134 | 770 | 1,607 |
|  |  | 2000 | 357 | 322 | 238 | 515 | 107 | 168 | 2 |  | 208 | 261 | 104 | 516 | 1,016 | 1,782 |
|  |  | 2001 | 102 | 574 | 320 | 474 | 475 | 285 | 113 | 9 | 99 | 294 | 100 | 495 | 1,209 | 2,131 |
|  |  | 2002 | 104 | 380 | 294 | 614 | 432 | 881 | 100 | 390 | 100 | 296 | 192 | 307 | 1,222 | 2,868 |
|  | LA | 1991 |  |  |  |  | 25 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 25 |  |
|  |  | 1992 | 189 |  | 25 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 214 |  |
|  |  | 1993 | 85 | 89 | 110 | 443 | 100 | 111 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 296 | 643 |
|  |  | 1994 | 130 | 285 | 373 | 139 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 503 | 424 |
|  |  | 1995 |  |  | 48 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 48 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 959 | 1,638 |  |  | 959 | 1,638 |
|  |  | 1999 | 341 | 852 | 498 | 979 |  |  |  |  | 278 | 1,047 | 99 |  | 1,216 | 2,878 |
|  |  | 2000 | 364 | 324 | 398 | 390 | 101 | 75 |  |  | 100 | 223 | 150 | 301 | 1,113 | 1,313 |
|  |  | 2001 | 108 | 280 | 442 | 487 | 100 | 182 | 63 |  | 204 | 442 | 100 | 523 | 1,017 | 1,914 |
|  |  | 2002 | 254 | 545 | 452 | 318 | 327 | 358 | 103 | 170 | 126 | 121 | 135 | 292 | 1,397 | 1,804 |
|  | TX | 1993 | 28 |  | 31 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 59 |  |
|  |  | 1998 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 140 | 239 |  |  | 140 | 239 |
|  |  | 1999 | 336 |  | 381 |  |  |  |  |  | 99 |  | 29 |  | 845 |  |
|  |  | 2000 | 46 |  | 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 58 |  |
|  |  | 2001 |  |  | 32 |  | 23 |  |  |  | 61 |  |  |  | 116 |  |
|  |  | 2002 | 98 |  | 251 |  | 71 |  |  |  | 24 |  |  |  | 444 |  |
|  | TOTAL |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | 3,368 | 3,962 | 4,893 | 4,885 | 2,220 | 2,060 | 658 | 569 | 3,416 | 5,686 | 1,232 | 2,568 | 15,787 | 19,730 |

## FIN approach:

The Fisheries Information Network (FIN); a state-federal cooperative program which is chiefly coordinated and administered via the Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission (GSMFC), developed a plan for prioritizing species and setting commercial and recreational targets for age information (GSMFC, 2003).
"These targets were developed based on historical commercial and recreational landings from 1999 and 2000. The numbers of otoliths were determined by multiplying $0.5 \%$ by the total number of fish for each state" (GSMFC, 2003).
"It needs to be noted that this is an initial step and the number of samples may be adjusted as more information is collected and becomes available" (GSMFC, 2003).

The year 2002 was the first year for this approach and red snapper was one of four species chosen due to funding levels. The $0.5 \%$ sampling fraction was based on an earlier sampling design for king mackerel but was recognized as being somewhat arbitrary as the full rationale was not available (first author's notes from a December 2000 meeting). It should be noted that more than four species continued to be sampled by state and federal samplers, as there is a list of 29 primary and 40 secondary species of concern, but this occurred on a continuing or ad-hoc basis. The point of the $0.5 \%$ fraction was to sample in a representational manner and simply to have a protocol with which to begin the program. With 6 bimonthly sampling periods (waves), 5 states, and 5 modes ( 3 recreational and 2 commercial), the result was 13,500 targeted red snapper otoliths from over 100 strata each year (GSMFC, 2003). Combining results from Table 1 and from Gulf States (Allman et al. 2004a and based on age data provided by David Donaldson, Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission), the collection target was exceeded in the first year-2002 (about 17,000 total otoliths). To date, $73 \%$ of the 2002 target (about 9,900 otoliths) has been aged based on federal and state tallies (Table 1 and Allman et al. 2004a). A comparison of commercial versus recreational targets is pending.

Prior to the 2002 onset of FIN sampling for red snapper age structure, there were considerations of red snapper sampling needs which served as precedents. Schirripa and Goodyear (1998) recommended 7500 otoliths to be collected annually from the commercial sector as a primary approach to simple random sampling. This number was based on extrapolation of a set percentage of 1997 landings reported at the level of the dealer. For a contingency plan, they recommended 7500 lengths to be measured and 50 otoliths per 1 inch interval be sampled resulting in an annual total of 2000 otoliths. Also
in 1998, guidance was provided by the Southeast Fishery Science Center to the Beaufort Headboat sampling program and to MRFSS contractors along the same lines as the Schirripa and Goodyear (1998) primary plan-advocating simple random sampling of these sectors in a representative fashion (series of SEFSC emails).

## Potential future sampling targets

Two-phase sampling for age using age-length keys, which takes advantage of low-cost length determination, is often preferred in fisheries monitoring. However, this approach doesn't work well when size-at-age is highly variable (Smith 1989). In a sub-tropical system such as the Gulf of Mexico, variable size-at-age seems to be a robust phenomenon. In a length-age plot, a $10-\mathrm{cm}$ size category approaching the asymptote can span about 52 age classes for gulf red snapper (Allman et al. 2004a). This leads to the desire to directly- and randomly sample the total catch for age structure. Since a principal need for stock assessment is to determine the age proportions characterizing the catch, the age data can be viewed as distributed according to a multinomial distribution (Quinn and Deriso 1999).

Thompson (1987) provides a fishery-based example of sample size determination using multinomial proportions. If a biologist needs to collect a sample of fish such that all age class proportions of the sample are within 0.05 of the population proportions, with $95 \%$ confidence, Thompson shows that a conservative and sufficient sample size is 510. This value holds irregardless of the number of age classes in the population. In our case, the population Thompson (1987) refers to is not necessarily the biological population but rather the population of the total catch measured via significant strata. Significant strata would be those groupings that are internally homogeneous and between which you would expect to find notable differences in the age structure. Year would be a significant strata because recruitment and mortality can change age structure annually. Gear would be a significant strata because the ages are notably different among some of the gears. These differences appear to arise from the particular gear selectivities and depths fished. This is clearly observed between longline and hook and line gear (Allman et al. 2002, 2004a). Region may be a significant strata because the underlying stock age structure can be
different in different areas due to harvest and possibly migration patterns. There is good evidence that those red snapper susceptable to longlining are of very different age structure in the eastern versus western gulf (Mitchell et al. submitted, Allman et al. 2004). So, considering the two gulf regions and the various gears where differences have been detectable (recreational hook and line, commercial hook and line, and commercial longline), about $3 * 2$ strata per year may be a useful approach to gauge sample size (thus about 3000 otoliths per year from the gulf) until- and if further stratification levels become apparent.

For red snapper, the age differences detected among strata seem to be quite consistent over time. For example, the differences between the eastern and western gulf, detectable among red snapper harvested by longline, seems to have persisted at least since the 1980s and perhaps longer (Mitchell et al. submitted). Even annual differences in age structure, detected from hook and line gear, don't seem to be very dramatic (Allman et al. 2004). Therefore, it doesn't appear that there is much of a risk in developing a bias in the catch age structure as long as these strata can be said to be randomly sampled.

Other forms of stratification may be useful for the administrative convenience of directing collection effort (Cochran 1977). Examples of administrative strata or "cells" are bimonthly periods, states, ports, dealers etc. As mentioned earlier, random sampling is a key assumption for estimating multinomial proportions. Random sampling is not easy to achieve in port sampling. Applying these types of cells to insure representative sampling can also help insure random sampling of the significant strata. While useful to guide sampling, we question whether administrative cells should be used to extrapolate and set an overall annual target sample size as has been advocated in earlier sampling plans. In order to minimize costs and balance resources for work on many species of concern, we propose that overall sampling targets be initially set using significant strata rather than administrative cells. The question of 'what is a significant stratum?' has been a point of debate and our hope is that panelists and others reviewing the 2004 stock assessment will examine this in more detail.

## Considerations about aging error

While some stock assessment modeling approaches consider the effects of aging error in attempts to statistically "correct" ages (Richards et al. 1992, Beamish and McFarlane 1995), no sampling design to date that we know of, explicitly accounts for aging error although Gröger (2003) addresses sample size needs for testing bias and degree of random precision error among age readers. The use of multinomial proportions, as well as other sampling-for-age-structure approaches, $\underline{\text { assumes that ages are determined without }}$ error. A factor inhibiting progress is that true measures of aging error are extremely difficult to accomplish and this is an area of active investigation (see Campana 2001).

But in considering a sampling design, any clear choice which would reduce aging error should merit attention. For red snapper, it would be important to minimize aging errors even occurring on the order of one year for the abundant young year classes (e.g., 2-8) as these will be the ages most likely to reveal year-class trends upon annual examination of age structure (see Allman et al. 2004a). Errors of one-year can commonly arise when otolith margins are examined by a reader and a determination must be made whether to advance the age or not. This occurs in the spring through early summer months corresponding to the formation of the opaque zone (Allman et al. 2004b). By restricting sampling to the late summer-fall period, opaque zone formation is complete and the ageadvance decision, with its inherent error, is minimized (Allman et al. 2004b). But restricting sampling on a seasonal basis could lead to bias because of the departure from representational sampling. For example, portions of the stock could be seasonally migratory between regions and this would be a concern for species such as king and Spanish mackerel (Doug DeVries, personal communication, NMFS, Panama City). However, for red snapper which does not show notable seasonal migrations among geographic regions ${ }^{1}$, late summer-fall sampling may offer no risk of sampling bias but rather only result in a reduction in aging error. We pose this issue as another sampling topic for examination.
${ }^{1}$ There is evidence that adult red snapper can exhibit onshore-offshore movements between summer and winter respectively, and that these movements are tracked in the fishery (Moe 1963, Bradley and Bryan 1975). Other known large-scale movements have been related to event phenomena such as hurricanes (Patterson et al. 2001).

## References

Allman, R.J., N.M. Evou, J.J. Mikulas, and G.R. Fitzhugh. 2000. Summary of 1999 reef fish age-structure samples for the Gulf of Mexico. Internal memorandum. NMFS, Panama City Laboratory, 5 pp.

Allman, R.J., G.R. Fitzhugh, W.A. Fable and L.A. Lombardi-Carlson. 2000. Report of red snapper otolith aging; 1999 data summary. NMFS, Panama City Laboratory, Contribution Series 00-03. 14 pp .

Allman, R.J., G.R. Fitzhugh and W.A. Fable. 2002. Report of red snapper otolith aging; 2000 data summary. NMFS, Panama City Laboratory, Contribution Series 02-02. 17 pp.

Allman, R.J., L.A. Lombardi-Carlson, G.R. Fitzhugh, and W.A. Fable. 2002. Age structure of red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus) in the Gulf of Mexico by fishing mode and region. Proceedings of the Gulf and Caribbean Fisheries Institute. 53:482-495.

Allman, R.J., G.R. Fitzhugh, W.A. Fable, L.A. Lombardi-Carlson and B.K. Burnett. 2004a. Red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus) otolith aging summary 1980 \& 1991-2003. NMFS, Panama City Laboratory, Contribution Series 04-03.

Allman, R.J., G.R. Fitzhugh, K.J. Starzinger and R.A. Farsky. 2004b. Precision of age estimation in red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus). NMFS. Panama City Laboratory Contribution Series: 04-04.

Beamish, R.J. and G.A. McFarlane 1995. A discussion of the importance of aging errors, and an application to walleye pollock: the world's largest fishery. pp. 545-565 in: D.H. Secor, J.M. Dean and S.E. Campana (eds.). Recent Developments in Fish Otolith Research. University of South Carolina Press. Columbia, S.C.

Bradley, E. and C.E. Bryan. 1975. Life history and fishery of the red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus) in the northwestern Gulf of Mexico:1970-1974. Proc. Gulf. Carib. Fish. Inst. 27(1975):77-106.

Campana, S.E. 2001. Accuracy, precision and quality control in age determination, including a review of the use and abuse of age validation methods. Journal of Fish Biology 59:197-242.

Cochran, W.G. 1977. Sampling Techniques. $3^{\text {rd }}$ edition John Wiley and Sons, New York. 428 p.

Fitzhugh, G.R., L.A. Collins, L.A. Lombardi, M.R. Burnett, W.A. Fable and W.T. Walling. 1999. Report of red snapper otolith aging and spawning/fecundity research: 1998 data summary. Panama City Laboratory Contribution Series 99-06. 17 pp.

Gulf States Marine Fisheries Commission. 2003. 2004 FIN data collection plan. Ocean Springs, Mississippi.

Schirripa, M.J. and C.P. Goodyear. 1998. Sampling protocol for commercially caught red snapper in the U.S. Gulf of Mexico. Memorandum, Southeast Fisheries Science Center, Miami, Florida. 10 p.

Gröger, J. 2003. Theoretical and practical considerations with respect to sample size in statistical quality control of otolith readings. Archive of Fishery and Marine Research 50(2):161-173.

Lombardi-Carlson, L.A., C.L. Palmer, J.J. Mikulas, N.M. Evou, R.J. Allman, G.R. Fitzhugh and D.A. DeVries. 2001. Summary of 2000 reef fish and mackerel age-structure samples received at Panama City. Internal memorandum. NMFS, Panama City Laboratory, 6 pp .

Lombardi-Carlson, L.A., C.L. Palmer, G.R. Fitzhugh, N.M. Evou, B. Barnett, N. Amesbury, R.J. Allman and D.A. DeVries. 2003. Summary of 2002 reef fish and mackerel age-structure samples received at NMFS, Panama City, Florida. Panama City Laboratory Contribution Series 03-01. 14 pp.

Mikulas, J.J., L. Lombardi-Carlson, G.R. Fitzhugh, C.L. Palmer, N.M. Evou, R.J. Allman and D.A. Devries. 2002. Summary of 2001 reef fish and mackerel age-structure samples received at Panama City. Panama City Laboratory Contribution Series 02-3. 7 pp.

Mitchell, K.M., T.Henwood, G.R. Fitzhugh, and R.J. Allman. 2004 (submitted). Distribution, abundance and age structure of red snapper (Lutjanus campechanus) caught on research longlines in the U.S. Gulf of Mexico. Gulf of Mexico Science.

Moe, M.A. Jr. 1963. A survey of offshore fishing in Florida. Prof. Paper Series. Marine Lab. Fla. No. 4: 1-117.

Patterson, W. F., III, J. C. Watterson, R. L. Shipp, and J. H. Cowan, Jr. 2001. Movement of tagged red snapper in the northern Gulf of Mexico. Transactions of the American Fisheries Society 130:533-545.

Quinn, T.J. and R.B. Deriso. 1999. Quantitative Fish Dynamics. Oxford University Press, New York, Oxford. 542 p.

Reef Fish Stock Assessment Panel.1999. September 1999 report of the Reef Fish Stock Assessment Panel. Gulf of Mexico Fishery Management Council 29 pp.

Richards, L.L. J.T. Schnute, A.R. Kronlund, and R.J. Beamish. 1992. Statistical models for the analysis of aging error. Can. J. Fish. Aquat. Sci. 49:1801-1815.

Schirripa, M.J. and C.M. Legault. 1999. Status of the red snapper in U.S. waters of the Gulf of Mexico: updated through 1998. NMFS, Southeast Fisheries Science Center, Sustainable Fisheries Division Contribution: SFD-99/00-75

Smith, P.J. 1989. Is two-phase sampling really better for estimating age composition? J. Am. Stat. Assoc. 84(408):916-921.

Thompson, S.K. 1987. Sample size for estimating multinomial proportions. The American Statistician 41(1):42-46.

